

**The Florida Senate**  
**BILL ANALYSIS AND FISCAL IMPACT STATEMENT**

(This document is based on the provisions contained in the legislation as of the latest date listed below.)

---

Prepared By: The Professional Staff of the Committee on Children, Families, and Elder Affairs

---

BILL: SB 1690

INTRODUCER: Senator Ingoglia

SUBJECT: Human Trafficking

DATE: March 24, 2023

REVISED: \_\_\_\_\_

ANALYST	STAFF DIRECTOR	REFERENCE	ACTION
1. Tuszynski	Cox	CF	<b>Pre-meeting</b>
2. _____	_____	AHS	_____
3. _____	_____	FP	_____

---

**I. Summary:**

SB 1690 creates s. 402.88, F.S., to codify a certification process for adult safe houses. These safe houses must be certified by the Department of Children and Families (DCF) to care for adults who have been sexually exploited or trafficked. The bill requires the DCF to establish a process to certify, inspect, and annually recertify adult safe houses that:

- Provide a facility that serves as an adult safe house to receive and shelter persons who are victims of human trafficking.
- Allow minor children and other dependents of the victim when such dependents are partly or wholly dependent on the victim, to be sheltered with the victim in an adult safe house.
- Receive annual written endorsement of local law enforcement.
- Provide certain minimum services;
- Participate in providing orientation and training programs developed for law enforcement, social workers, and other professionals who work with human trafficking victims.
- Provide a safe, therapeutic environment tailored to the needs of CSE or trafficked adults who have endured significant trauma using strength-based and trauma-informed treatment models.
- File with the DCF a list of specified information, amended as necessary, of human trafficking advocates employed or volunteering at the adult safe house who may claim privilege under s. 90.5037, F.S., to refuse to disclose certain information.
- Comply with rules adopted under the section.

The bill allows the DCF to deny, suspend, or revoke the certification of an adult safe house that fails to comply with the requirements of the bill.

The bill allows the DCF to exempt the hotline, professional training, or community education requirements for a new adult safe house if already provided by another adult safe house within the designated service area to avoid duplication of services.

The bill also outlines the training of adult safe house staff and requires the DCF to ensure that staff has completed said training, the contents of which are to be specified by rule.

The bill creates s. 409.16781, F.S. to require the DCF to develop age-appropriate educational programming for children regarding the signs and dangers of, and how to report, human trafficking. The educational programming must be developed for facilities, which includes licensed residential facilities under s. 393.063, F.S.,<sup>1</sup> or safe houses or safe foster homes.<sup>2</sup> The bill requires each facility with teenage children to provide the training at least annually.

The bill amends s. 787.29, F.S., F.S., requiring the DCF to develop age-appropriate public awareness signs on human trafficking in conjunction with this educational programming for display in certain settings. The bill requires the signs be conspicuously placed to warn youth of the dangers of human trafficking and to encourage the reporting of individuals observed attempting to engage in human trafficking activity and contain the telephone number for either the National Human Trafficking Resource Center or other number that the Florida Department of Law Enforcement uses to detect and stop human trafficking.

The bill also amends s. 409.1678, F.S. to detail that appropriate security for Safe Houses and Safe Foster Homes must include a least one individual on staff with law enforcement, investigative, or other similar training, as established by rule by the DCF. The purpose of this staff member is the detection of possible trafficking activity around a facility, to be an emergency responder to look for absent or missing children, and for coordination with law enforcement.

The bill will have a significant negative fiscal impact on state government. See Section V. Fiscal Impact Statement.

The bill takes effect July 1, 2023.

## **II. Present Situation:**

### **Human Trafficking**

The Florida Legislature recognizes human trafficking as a form of modern-day slavery whose victims include young children, teenagers, and adults who may be citizens that are trafficked domestically within the borders of the United States or smuggled across international borders worldwide.<sup>3</sup> While victims of human trafficking are forced to work in prostitution or sexual

---

<sup>1</sup> Residential facilities defined under this section of law are: “Foster Care Facility” meaning a licensed residential facility which provides a family living environment including supervision and care necessary to meet the physical, emotional, and social needs of its residents. The capacity of such a facility may not be more than three residents; “Group Home Facility,” meaning licensed residential facility which provides a family living environment including supervision and care necessary to meet the physical, emotional, and social needs of its residents. The capacity of such a facility shall be at least 4 but not more than 15 residents; “Intermediate care facility for the developmentally disabled” meaning the same as part VIII of ch. 400, F.S.; and “Residential habilitation center” meaning a licensed community residential facility which provides habilitation services. The capacity of such a facility may not be fewer than nine residents, in existence prior to October 1, 1989.

<sup>2</sup> Section 409.1678, F.S. defines “Safe foster home” as a foster home certified by the DCF to care for sexually exploited children and “Safe house” as a group residential placement certified by the DCF to care for sexually exploited children.

<sup>3</sup> Section 787.06, F.S.

entertainment, trafficking also occurs in forms of labor exploitation, such as domestic servitude, restaurant work, janitorial work, factory work, and agricultural work.<sup>4</sup> Many human trafficking victims are induced with false promises of financial or emotional security, but are forced or coerced<sup>5</sup> into commercial sexual activity,<sup>6</sup> domestic servitude, or other types of forced labor.<sup>7</sup>

### ***Human Trafficking in Florida***

Florida law defines “human trafficking” as transporting, soliciting, recruiting, harboring, providing, enticing, maintaining,<sup>8</sup> purchasing, patronizing, procuring, or obtaining<sup>9</sup> another person for the purpose of exploitation of that person.<sup>10</sup> In Florida, any person who knowingly, or in reckless disregard of the facts, engages in human trafficking, or attempts to engage in human trafficking, or benefits financially by receiving anything of value from participation in a venture that has subjected a person to human trafficking for labor or services, or commercial sexual activity, commits a crime.<sup>11</sup> Florida law sets out several circumstances which give rise to specified penalties including, in part:

- Labor or services of any child under the age of 18 commits a first degree felony;<sup>12</sup>
- Labor or services of any child under the age of 18 who is an unauthorized alien<sup>13</sup> commits a first degree felony;<sup>14</sup>
- Labor or services who does so by the transfer or transport of any child under the age of 18 from outside of Florida to within Florida commits a first degree felony;<sup>15</sup>

---

<sup>4</sup> *Id.*

<sup>5</sup> Section 787.06(2)(a), F.S., defines “coercion” in the context of human trafficking as using or threatening physical force; restraining, isolating, or confining or threatening the same without lawful authority and against his or her will; using lending or other credit methods to establish a debt when labor or services are pledged as a security for the debt, if the reasonably assessed value of the labor or services is not applied toward liquidation of the debt, and the length and nature of the labor or service and not limited and defined; destroying, concealing, removing, confiscating, withholding, or possessing any actual or purported passport, visa, or other immigration document of any person; causing or threatening to cause financial harm, enticing or luring by fraud or deceit; or providing controlled substances to any person for the purpose of exploitation.

<sup>6</sup> Section 787.062(2)(b), F.S., defines “commercial sexual activity” as any violation of ch. 796, F.S., or an attempt to commit any such offense, and includes sexually explicit performances and the production of pornography.

<sup>7</sup> The Department of Education, *Healthy Schools – Human Trafficking*, available at <http://www.fl DOE.org/schools/healthy-schools/human-trafficking.stml> (last visited March 19, 2023).

<sup>8</sup> Section 787.06(2)(f), F.S., provides “maintain” means, in relation to labor or services, to secure or make possible continued performance thereof, regardless of any initial agreement on the part of the victim to perform such type service. Section 787.06(2)(h), F.S., defines “services” as any act committed at the behest of, under the supervision of, or for the benefit of another, including forced marriage, servitude, or the removal of organs.

<sup>9</sup> Section 787.06(2)(g), F.S., provides “obtain” means, in relation to labor, commercial sexual activity, or services, to receive, take possession of, or take custody of another person or secure performance thereof. Section 787.06(2)(e), F.S., provides “labor” means work of economic or financial value.

<sup>10</sup> Section 787.06(2)(d), F.S.

<sup>11</sup> Section 787.06(3), F.S.

<sup>12</sup> Section 787.06(3)(a)1., F.S. A first degree felony is punishable by a state prison term not exceeding 30 years, a fine not exceeding \$10,000, or both. Sections 775.082 and 775.083, F.S.

<sup>13</sup> Section 787.06(2)(j), F.S., defines “unauthorized alien” as an alien who is not authorized under federal law to be employed in the United States, as provided in 8 U.S.C. s. 1324a(h)(3).

<sup>14</sup> Section 787.06(3)(c)1., F.S.

<sup>15</sup> Section 787.06(3)(e)1., F.S.

- Commercial sexual activity<sup>16</sup> who does so by the transfer or transport of any child under the age of 18 from outside of Florida to within Florida commits a first degree felony;<sup>17</sup> or
- Commercial sexual activity in which any child under the age of 18, or in which any person who is mentally defective<sup>18</sup> or mentally incapacitated<sup>19</sup> is involved commits a life felony.<sup>20</sup>

The above-mentioned first-degree felonies are reclassified as a life felony if a person causes great bodily harm, permanent disability, or permanent disfigurement to another person during the commission of the offense.<sup>21</sup> Ignorance of the human trafficking victim's age, the victim's misrepresentation of his or her age, or a bona fide belief of the victim's age cannot be raised as a defense by a defendant.<sup>22</sup>

Florida is ranked the third highest state of reported human trafficking cases in the United States.<sup>23</sup> In 2021, reports of commercially exploited children to the Florida Abuse Hotline remained relatively stable, increasing from 3,181 reports in 2020 to 3,182 reports in 2021.<sup>24</sup>

### ***Child Sexual Exploitation in Florida***

It is difficult to obtain an accurate count of commercial sexual exploitation (CSE) victims who are children because these victims are not readily identifiable.<sup>25</sup> CSE victims do not have immediately recognizable characteristics, many do not have identification, and they are often physically or psychologically controlled by adult traffickers; as such, they rarely disclose or provide information on exploitation.<sup>26</sup>

<sup>16</sup> Section 787.06(2)(b), F.S., defines “commercial sexual activity” as any violation of ch. 796, F.S., or an attempt to commit any such offense, and includes sexually explicit performances and the production of pornography. Section 787.06(2)(i), F.S., defines “sexual explicit performance” as an act or show, whether public or private, that is live, photographed, recorded, or videotaped and intended to arouse or satisfy the sexual desires or appeal to the prurient interest.

<sup>17</sup> Section 787.06(3)(f)1., F.S., provides that an offense committed under these circumstances is punishable by a term of imprisonment not exceeding life or as provided in ss. 775.082, 775.083, or 775.084, F.S.

<sup>18</sup> Section 794.011(1)(c), F.S., defines “mentally defective” as a mental disease or defect which renders a person temporarily or permanently incapable of appraising the nature of his or her conduct.

<sup>19</sup> Section 794.011(1)(d), F.S., defines “mental incapacitated” as temporarily incapable of appraising or controlling a person's own conduct due to the influence of a narcotic, anesthetic, or intoxicating substance administered without his or her consent or due to any other act committed upon that person without his or her consent.

<sup>20</sup> A life felony is punishable by a term of life imprisonment, \$15,000 fine, or both as provided in s. 775.082(3)(a)6., F.S., s. 775.083, F.S., or s. 775.084, F.S.

<sup>21</sup> Section 787.06(8)(b), F.S.

<sup>22</sup> Section 787.06(9), F.S.

<sup>23</sup> Florida Alliance to End Human Trafficking, *The Issue*, available at <https://floridaallianceendht.com/the-issue/> (last visited March 19, 2023).

<sup>24</sup> The Office of Program Policy Analysis and Government Accountability, *Annual Report on the Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children in Florida*, 2022, p. 2, July 2022, available at <https://oppaga.fl.gov/Documents/Reports/22-05.pdf> (last visited March 19, 2023).

<sup>25</sup> Office of Program Policy Analysis & Government Accountability, *Placement Challenges Persist for Child Victims of Commercial Sexual Exploitation; Questions Regarding Effective Interventions and Outcomes Remain*, (Jul. 2016), available at <https://oppaga.fl.gov/Products/ReportDetail?rn=16-04> (last visited March 22, 2023).

<sup>26</sup> U.S. Department of Justice, Office of Juvenile Justice and Delinquency Prevention, *Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children and Sex Trafficking*, available at [https://ojdp.ojp.gov/model-programs-guide/literature-reviews/commercial\\_sexual\\_exploitation\\_of\\_children\\_and\\_sex\\_trafficking.pdf](https://ojdp.ojp.gov/model-programs-guide/literature-reviews/commercial_sexual_exploitation_of_children_and_sex_trafficking.pdf) (last visited March 22, 2023).

For calendar year 2021, the DCF verified 377 child victims of commercial sexual exploitation from 3,182 reports alleging commercial sexual exploitation made to the hotline.<sup>27</sup> Of the reports that were referred for investigation, most came from the Department of Juvenile Justice (DJJ), the Department of Corrections, or criminal justice personnel and law enforcement.<sup>28</sup> Of the 377 verified commercially sexually exploited children, 25% were in out-of-home care, including the care of relatives or in foster homes, residential group care, or residential treatment centers.<sup>29</sup>

### ***Safe Houses and Safe Foster Homes for Child-victims of Human Trafficking***

Current law defines and provides for the certification of specialized residential options for children who are victims of human trafficking or commercial sexual exploitation (CSE).<sup>30</sup> The law defines a “safe foster home” to mean a foster home certified by the DCF to care for sexually exploited children and a “safe house” to mean a group residential placement certified by the DCF to care for sexually exploited children.<sup>31</sup> To be certified, a safe house or safe foster home must:

- Use strength-based and trauma-informed approaches to care, to the extent possible and appropriate.
- Serve exclusively one sex.
- Group child victims of CSE by age or maturity level.
- Care for child victims of CSE in a manner that separates those children from children with other needs. Safe houses and safe foster homes may care for other populations if the children who have not experienced commercial sexual exploitation do not interact with children who have experienced commercial sexual exploitation.
- Have awake staff members on duty 24 hours a day, if a safe house.
- Provide appropriate security through facility design, hardware, technology, staffing, and siting, including, but not limited to, external video monitoring or door exit alarms, a high staff-to-client ratio, or being situated in a remote location that is isolated from major transportation centers and common trafficking areas.
- Meet other criteria established by department rule,<sup>32</sup> which may include, but are not limited to, personnel qualifications, staffing ratios, and types of services offered.<sup>33</sup>

### ***At-Risk Houses***

At-Risk Houses are group care homes that are certified to serve children considered to be at-risk for sex trafficking. Children are deemed to be “at risk of sex trafficking” if they have experienced trauma, such as abuse, neglect, and/or maltreatment, and present one or more of the accompanying risk factors: history of running away and/or homelessness; history of sexual abuse and/or sexually acting out behavior; inappropriate interpersonal and/or social media boundaries; family history of or exposure to human trafficking; or, out-of-home placement instability

---

<sup>27</sup> Office of Program Policy Analysis & Government Accountability, *Annual Report on the Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children in Florida*, 2022, Report 22-05, July 2022, pp. i and 2, available at <https://oppaga.fl.gov/Products/ReportDetail?rn=22-05> (last viewed March 22, 2023).

<sup>28</sup> *Id.*

<sup>29</sup> *Id.*, p. 4.

<sup>30</sup> Section 409.1678, F.S.

<sup>31</sup> Section 409.1678(1), F.S.

<sup>32</sup> Rule 65C-46.020, F.A.C.

<sup>33</sup> Section 409.1678(2)(c), F.S.

demonstrated by repeated moves from less restrictive levels of care. There are currently 157 At-Risk Houses licensed by DCF to provide services to youth who are at risk of sex trafficking.<sup>34</sup>

### ***Safe Houses for Adult Survivors of Human Trafficking***

The DCF reports they are aware of 13 adult safe houses that provide services to adult survivors of human trafficking.<sup>35</sup> Of these, two allow for the survivor's minor children to also reside in the home.<sup>36</sup>

The DCF does not regulate or monitor any of the 13 adult safe houses<sup>37</sup> and current law provides no framework for any agency to do so.

### ***Privileged Communication between Human Trafficking Victims and Others***

Section 90.5037, F.S., creates a privilege to refuse to disclose confidential communications or records between human trafficking victims and human trafficking victim advocates or trained volunteers made in the course of advising, counseling, or providing services. The law gives a human trafficking victim the power to not personally disclose and also prevent disclosure by any other person.<sup>38</sup>

This privilege may be claimed by:

- The victim of human trafficking.
- The guardian or conservator of a victim.
- The personal representative of a deceased victim.
- The human trafficking victim advocate or trained volunteer, but only on behalf of the human trafficking victim. The authority to claim this privilege is presumed in the absence of evidence to the contrary.<sup>39</sup>

## **III. Effect of Proposed Changes:**

### **Adult Safe Houses**

The bill creates s. 402.88, F.S., to codify a certification process for adult safe houses. These safe houses must be certified by the Department of Children and Families (DCF) to care for adults who have been sexually exploited or trafficked.

The bill requires the DCF to establish a process to certify adult safe houses that:

- Provide a facility that serves as an adult safe house to receive and house persons who are victims of human trafficking.
  - Minor children and other dependents of the victim when such dependents are partly or wholly dependent on the victim, may be sheltered with the victim in an adult safe house.

---

<sup>34</sup> The DCF, 2023 Agency Legislative Bill Analysis, SB 1690, *Human Trafficking*, p. 3 (on file with Committee on Children, Families, and Elder Affairs Staff).

<sup>35</sup> The DCF, 2023 Agency Legislative Bill Analysis, SB 1690, 3/14/23, p. 2. (On file with the Committee on Children, Families, and Elder Affairs).

<sup>36</sup> *Id.*

<sup>37</sup> *Id.*

<sup>38</sup> Section 90.5037(3), F.S.

<sup>39</sup> Section 90.5037(4), F.S.

- Receive annual written endorsement of local law enforcement.
- Provide the following minimum services:
  - Information and referral;
  - Licensed counseling and case management;
  - Substance abuse screening and access or referral to treatment;
  - Temporary emergency shelter for more than 24 hours;
  - Operation of a 24-hour hotline;
  - Nonresidential outreach services;
  - Training for law enforcement personnel;
  - Assessment and appropriate referral of resident children; and
  - Educational services for community awareness, prevention, and services available for persons subject to human trafficking.
- Participate in providing orientation and training programs developed for law enforcement, social workers, and other professionals who work with human trafficking victims.
- Provide a safe, therapeutic environment tailored to the needs of CSE or trafficked adults who have endured significant trauma using strength-based and trauma-informed treatment models.
- File with the DCF a list, amended as necessary, of human trafficking advocates employed or volunteering at the adult safe house who may claim privilege under s. 90.5037, F.S.,<sup>40</sup> to refuse to disclose certain information. The list must include the title of the position held by the advocate and a description of the duties of his or her position.
- Comply with rules adopted under the section.

The bill allows the DCF to exempt the hotline, professional training, or community education requirements for a new adult safe house if already provided by another adult safe house within the designated service area to avoid duplication of services.

The bill requires the DCF to inspect and annually certify adult safe houses to ensure compliance with the requirements of the section and allows the denial, suspension, or revocation of certification if an adult safe house fails to comply with those requirements.

The bill also outlines the training of adult safe house staff and requires the DCF to ensure that staff has completed said training, the contents of which are to be specified by rule.

The bill allows the DCF to adopt rules to implement the section.

### **Education and Signage**

The bill creates s. 409.16781, F.S. to require the DCF to develop age-appropriate educational programming for children regarding the signs and dangers of, and how to report, human trafficking. The educational programming must be developed for facilities, defined as a licensed

---

<sup>40</sup> Section 90.5037, F.S. makes certain communications between certain human trafficking victim's advocates and human trafficking victims confidential.

residential facility under s. 393.063, F.S.,<sup>41</sup> or safe house or safe foster home.<sup>42</sup> The bill requires each facility with teenage children to provide the training at least annually.

The bill amend s. 787.29, F.S., F.S., requiring the DCF to develop age-appropriate public awareness signs on human trafficking in conjunction with this educational programming for display in each:

- Emergency shelter;
- Runaway shelter;
- Group home;
- Agency-operated group treatment home;
- Non-psychiatric residential group care facility;
- Psychiatric residential treatment facility;
- Safe house; and
- Other appropriate facilities that provide shelter and care for dependent children.

The bill requires the signs be conspicuously placed to warn youth of the dangers of human trafficking and to encourage the reporting of individuals observed attempting to engage in human trafficking activity and contain the telephone number for either the National Human Trafficking Resource Center or other number that the Florida Department of Law Enforcement uses to detect and stop human trafficking.

The bill also moves and renumbers a paragraph related to county ordinance enforcement for clarity.

### **Certification of Safe Houses and Safe Foster Homes**

The bill also amends s. 409.1678, F.S. to detail that appropriate security for Safe Houses and Safe Foster Homes includes a least one individual on staff with law enforcement, investigative, or other similar training, as established by rule by the department. The purpose of this staff member is the detection of possible trafficking activity around a facility, to be an emergency responder to look for absent or missing children, and for coordination with law enforcement.

The bill takes effect July 1, 2023

---

<sup>41</sup> Residential facilities defined under this section of law are: “Foster Care Facility” meaning a licensed residential facility which provides a family living environment including supervision and care necessary to meet the physical, emotional, and social needs of its residents. The capacity of such a facility may not be more than three residents; “Group Home Facility,” meaning licensed residential facility which provides a family living environment including supervision and care necessary to meet the physical, emotional, and social needs of its residents. The capacity of such a facility shall be at least 4 but not more than 15 residents; “Intermediate care facility for the developmentally disabled” meaning the same as part VIII of ch. 400, F.S.; and “Residential habilitation center” meaning a licensed community residential facility which provides habilitation services. The capacity of such a facility may not be fewer than nine residents, in existence prior to October 1, 1989.

<sup>42</sup> Section 409.1678, F.S. defines “Safe foster home” as a foster home certified by the DCF to care for sexually exploited children and “Safe house” as a group residential placement certified by the DCF to care for sexually exploited children.



**IV. Constitutional Issues:****A. Municipality/County Mandates Restrictions:**

None.

**B. Public Records/Open Meetings Issues:**

None.

**C. Trust Funds Restrictions:**

None.

**D. State Tax or Fee Increases:**

None.

**E. Other Constitutional Issues:**

None identified.

**V. Fiscal Impact Statement:****A. Tax/Fee Issues:**

None.

**B. Private Sector Impact:**

None.

**C. Government Sector Impact:**

It is unknown how many new adult safe houses will require certification. The DCF projects a fiscal impact of \$370,145 recurring and \$404,275 nonrecurring for staff and technology to certify the 13 known adult safe houses.<sup>43</sup>

**Staff**

The DCF projects an estimated 100 hours of staff time, per safe house, to complete pre-monitoring, travel, inspections, post site monitoring/follow up, and administrative actions and anticipates needing at least three FTEs for regional certification specialists to implement, including: three Operation Review Specialists as Certification Specialists: **\$301,420** (\$285,145 recurring / \$16,275 nonrecurring). This includes a base salary

---

<sup>43</sup> The Department of Children and Families, 2023 Agency Legislative Bill Analysis, SB 1690, *Human Trafficking*, p. 7 (on file with Committee on Children, Families, and Elder Affairs Staff).

(\$50,192) and benefits package (\$24,347) for each of the three certification specialists, plus travel, and other recurring and nonrecurring expenses.<sup>44</sup>

### **Technology**

The DCF projects needing three consultants to develop the technology platform to support adult safe house certification and one FTE for ongoing maintenance and operation to implement the requirements of the bill.<sup>45</sup> The three consultants would require **\$388,000 in nonrecurring funding** and the one FTE would require **\$75,000 in recurring funding**.<sup>46</sup>

## **VI. Technical Deficiencies:**

Lines 42 through 43: The DCF does not have the authority to enforce a requirement to display human trafficking awareness signs in strip clubs and massage and bodywork establishments.

Lines 62 through 81: The DCF has some rule authority governing residential child-caring agencies, safe homes, and residential treatment centers; however, the new language requiring the display of signs developed by DCF by those agencies and centers, and the use of educational programming in safe houses and homes are in sections where DCF does not have rule-making authority.

## **VII. Related Issues:**

None.

## **VIII. Statutes Affected:**

This bill substantially amends sections 787.29 and 409.1678 of the Florida Statutes. This bill creates section 402.88 and 409.16781 of the Florida Statutes.

## **IX. Additional Information:**

### **A. Committee Substitute – Statement of Changes:**

(Summarizing differences between the Committee Substitute and the prior version of the bill.)

None.

### **B. Amendments:**

None.

---

This Senate Bill Analysis does not reflect the intent or official position of the bill's introducer or the Florida Senate.

---

---

<sup>44</sup> *Id.*

<sup>45</sup> *Id.* at pp. 8-9

<sup>46</sup> *Id.*